

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE  
FOURTEENTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE**

---

**First Session**

---

FRIDAY, 3 MARCH 2023

*No. 91*

**10.30 am**

1

---

PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr Tan Chuan-Jin (Marine Parade)).

Mr ABDUL SAMAD (Nominated Member).

Ms JANET ANG (Nominated Member).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (West Coast).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Minister for Education.

Miss CHERYL CHAN WEI LING (East Coast).

Mr MARK CHAY (Nominated Member).

Mr CHEE HONG TAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Miss CHENG LI HUI (Tampines).

Mr EDWARD CHIA BING HUI (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr CHONG KEE HIONG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr DESMOND CHOO (Tampines).

Mr ERIC CHUA (Tanjong Pagar) Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr CHUA KHENG WEE LOUIS (Sengkang).

Mr DARRYL DAVID (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah), Deputy Speaker.

Ms FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Minister for Sustainability and the Environment.

Ms GAN SIOW HUANG (Marymount), Minister of State, Ministry of Education and Ministry of Manpower.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Aljunied).

---

Mr DERRICK GOH (Nee Soon).

Ms HE TING RU (Sengkang).

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Jalan Besar), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (East Coast), Deputy Prime Minister and Coordinating Minister for Economic Policies.

Prof HOON HIAN TECK (Nominated Member).

Mr SHAWN HUANG WEI ZHONG (Jurong).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Finance, Second Minister for National Development and Leader of the House.

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister for Transport and Minister-in-charge of Trade Relations.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of Health and Government Whip.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment and Ministry of Transport.

Prof KOH LIAN PIN (Nominated Member).

Dr KOH POH KOON (Tampines), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Manpower and Ministry of Sustainability and the Environment.

Mr KWEK HIAN CHUAN HENRY (Kebun Baru).

Mr DESMOND LEE (West Coast), Minister for National Development and Minister-in-charge of Social Services Integration.

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEONG MUN WAI (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Bukit Panjang).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Assoc Prof JAMUS JEROME LIM (Sengkang).

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Sembawang).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms MARIAM JAAFAR (Sembawang).

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister for Social and Family Development, Second Minister for Health and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Education and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr MOHD FAHMI BIN ALIMAN (Marine Parade).

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc Prof Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of National Development.

---

Mr MURALI PILLAI (Bukit Batok).

Ms NADIA AHMAD SAMDIN (Ang Mo Kio).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence.

Ms NG LING LING (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr LOUIS NG KOK KWANG (Nee Soon).

Miss RACHEL ONG (West Coast).

Mr ONG YE KUNG (Sembawang), Minister for Health.

Ms JOAN PEREIRA (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr LEON PERERA (Aljunied).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Jalan Besar).

Ms POH LI SAN (Sembawang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied), Leader of the Opposition.

Ms RAHAYU MAHZAM (Jurong), Senior Parliamentary Secretary, Ministry of Health and Ministry of Law.

Mr SAKTIANDI SUPAAT (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade).

Dr SHAHIRA ABDULLAH (Nominated Member).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Home Affairs and Minister for Law.

Mr SHARAEL TAHA (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Ministry of National Development and Deputy Government Whip.

Mr SITO H YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Ms HANY SOH (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms SUN XUELING (Punggol West), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Social and Family Development.

Mr ALVIN TAN (Tanjong Pagar), Minister of State, Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth and Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Ms CARRIE TAN (Nee Soon).

Mr DENNIS TAN LIP FONG (Hougang).

Mr DESMOND TAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast), Deputy Speaker.

Mr TAN KIAT HOW (East Coast), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Communications and Information and Ministry of National Development.

Dr TAN SEE LENG (Marine Parade), Minister for Manpower and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr TAN WU MENG (Jurong).

Dr TAN YIA SWAM (Nominated Member).

---

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Pioneer).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for National Security.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Jalan Besar), Minister for Communications and Information and Second Minister for Home Affairs.

Mr RAJ JOSHUA THOMAS (Nominated Member).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Marine Parade), Minister for Culture, Community and Youth and Second Minister for Law.

Dr WAN RIZAL (Jalan Besar).

Mr DON WEE (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance.

Mr XIE YAO QUAN (Jurong).

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Marsiling-Yew Tee).

Ms YEO WAN LING (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr YIP HON WENG (Yio Chu Kang).

Mr MELVIN YONG YIK CHYE (Radin Mas).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Marsiling-Yew Tee), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Manpower and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr ZHULKARNAIN ABDUL RAHIM (Chua Chu Kang).

ABSENT:

Mr CHENG HSING YAO (Nominated Member).

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Ms HAZEL POA (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Senior Minister and Coordinating Minister for Social Policies.

Ms TIN PEI LING (MacPherson).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for Foreign Affairs.

---

- 
- 1 Papers presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
- 1.1 Land Betterment Charge (Table of Rates and Valuation Method) (Amendment) Regulations 2023 – Presented on 3 March 2023 (S. L. 809 of 2023)
- 1.2 Customs (Duties) (Amendment) Order 2023 – Presented on 3 March 2023 (S. L. 810 of 2023)
- 2 6 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 Estimates for the financial year 1 April 2023 to 31 March 2024 (Paper Cmd. 20 of 2023) – Committee of Supply (6<sup>th</sup> Allotted Day) – Supply considered in the Committee:

*(In the Committee)*

Head W – Ministry of Transport –

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head W of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Saktiandi Supaat).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$2,550,842,700 for Head W agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$10,165,701,000 for Head W agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head O – Ministry of Health –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head O of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Dr Tan Wu Meng).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$15,511,404,200 for Head O agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$1,377,740,000 for Head O agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

Head I – Ministry of Social and Family Development –

Amendment proposed, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head I of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Seah Kian Peng); Debate arising.

- 4 Extension of Sitting – Pursuant to Standing Order No 91(3)(d), Mr Deputy Speaker extended the sitting beyond the time specified for the Committee of Supply for a period of up to 30 minutes.
- 5 Estimates for the financial year 1 April 2023 to 31 March 2024 (Paper Cmd. 20 of 2023) – Consideration in the Committee of Supply resumed.

*(In the Committee)*

Head I – Ministry of Social and Family Development –

Debate resumed on Question, "That the total sum to be allocated for Head I of the Estimates be reduced by \$100." – (Mr Seah Kian Peng).

Amendment, by leave, withdrawn.

The sum of \$4,061,739,900 for Head I agreed to stand part of the Main Estimates.

The sum of \$103,868,000 for Head I agreed to stand part of the Development Estimates.

---

With the consent of Mr Deputy Speaker, Motion made, and Question put – Resolved, "That progress be reported now and leave be asked to sit again on Monday, 6 March 2023." – (Minister for Social and Family Development).

Progress reported – (Minister for Social and Family Development).

Committee to sit again on Monday, 6 March 2023.

- 6 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to Monday, 6 March 2023."

Adjourned at 8.17 pm

TAN CHUAN-JIN,  
*Speaker*

---

**MEMORANDUM**

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 10.30 am on Monday, 6 March 2023.

---